

Human Relations

<http://hum.sagepub.com>

Leader Behavior in a Police Organization Revisited

Arthur P. Brief, Ramon J. Aldag, Craig J. Russell and Dale E. Rude

Human Relations 1981; 34; 1037

DOI: 10.1177/001872678103401202

The online version of this article can be found at:

<http://hum.sagepub.com/cgi/content/abstract/34/12/1037>

Published by:



<http://www.sagepublications.com>

On behalf of:



The Tavistock Institute

Additional services and information for *Human Relations* can be found at:

Email Alerts: <http://hum.sagepub.com/cgi/alerts>

Subscriptions: <http://hum.sagepub.com/subscriptions>

Reprints: <http://www.sagepub.com/journalsReprints.nav>

Permissions: <http://www.sagepub.co.uk/journalsPermissions.nav>

Citations <http://hum.sagepub.com/cgi/content/refs/34/12/1037>

Leader Behavior in a Police Organization Revisited

Arthur P. Brief

New York University

Ramon J. Aldag¹

University of Wisconsin-Madison

Craig J. Russell and Dale E. Rude

University of Iowa

For a sample of police personnel, a longitudinal design was employed to examine the relationships between leader role clarification behaviors and subordinate job satisfaction and attitudes toward citizenry as well as the role of perceived skill variety as a potential moderator of those relationships. Further, both the relationships of perceived skill variety to employee responses and the potential moderating role of job longevity on those relationships were considered. Only weak support was provided for the contention that leader role clarification behaviors are favorably associated with subordinate responses. Contrary to the findings of previous studies, relationships of skill variety to responses were weak and inconsistent and neither perceived skill variety nor job longevity played a meaningful moderating role on focal relationships. Relevant differences between the current and past studies, implications of findings of the current study, and suggestions for future research are presented.

INTRODUCTION

Several authors have noted the ambiguous nature of the police officer's role (e.g., Bittner, 1967; Cicourel, 1967; Skolnick, 1966). While those researchers have focused on the ambiguity inherent in the role of the officer

¹Requests for reprints should be sent to Dr. Ramon J. Aldag, Graduate School of Business, University of Wisconsin—Madison, Madison, Wisconsin 53706.

in society, rather than in the organization, Brief, Aldag, and Wallden (1976) have suggested that such ambiguity may result in a generalized desire for increased structure on the job. For a sample of police officers, Brief et al. (1976) reported strong positive correlations between perceptions of supervisory initiating structure (that is, the extent to which the supervisor structures the subordinate's task) and a variety of experienced psychological states and affective responses including job satisfaction, organizational commitment, and favorability of attitudes toward citizenry. Following the reasoning of House (1971), they argued that supervisory initiating structure may be welcomed by police officers as a way of reducing role ambiguity. Further, such desires may be compounded by uncertainties resulting from the limited observability of many officers by their supervisors (e.g., Brown, 1977; 1978). In a later study, Aldag and Brief (1978) presented evidence which indicated that role ambiguity acts as an intervening variable between perceptions of supervisory style and affective responses and, therefore, provided support for the prior arguments of Brief et al. (1976).

More recently, Jermier and Berkes (1979), employing a line of reasoning somewhat similar to that of Brief et al. (1976), found that for police officers who saw their jobs as highly variable, perceived leader behaviors which clarify what is expected of subordinates in their work roles were positively related to job satisfaction. However, for police officers who perceived their jobs as relatively low in variability, no such relationship was detected. After Kerr (1977) and others (House & Dessler, 1974; March & Simon, 1958; Perrow, 1967; Schriesheim & Von Glinow, 1977; Van de Ven, Delbecq, & Koenig, 1976), Jermier and Berkes reasoned that these findings indicate that tasks which are viewed as simple, repetitive, and unambiguous (i.e., low in task variability) serve as substitutes for instrumental leader behavior. Further, they noted that most police organizations have adopted a quasimilitary organization model characterized by a rigid rank hierarchy of authority, impersonality, and authoritarian command structure (e.g., Cordner, 1978; Johnson, 1975; Moore, 1976; Reams, Kuykendall, & Burns, 1975; Sandler & Mintz, 1974; Swank, 1975). In light of the fact that such a model makes no provision for situations where hierarchical leadership will not influence subordinates, Jermier and Berkes concluded that their results raise serious questions about the advisability of applying a quasimilitary ideology to the structurings of police organizations.

The current study attempts to extend the prior research findings reviewed above by assessing the influence of police leader behavior under varying conditions of task structure in the context of a panel design. Such a longitudinal design is preferable to the cross-sectional designs employed by Aldag and Brief (1978) and Jermier and Berkes (1979) in that inferences regarding causality can more securely be drawn. Further, the current study

expands the list of outcomes investigated by Jermier and Berkes to include police attitudes toward citizenry. This is important because Jermier and Berkes, after Sandler and Mintz (1974), contend that a move away from the prevalent quasimilitary structure of police departments may provide models of interpersonal interaction helpful in reorienting authoritarian interaction between police and citizens. Since the particular police attitudes toward citizenry investigated in the current study (i.e., perceived citizen support, general faith in people, defensive posture, and stereotype of poor people) have been shown to be related to police behavior (cf. Kelly & Farber, 1974), they provide a vehicle for examination of Jermier and Berkes' contention.

The previous discussion emphasized the potential moderating effects of task structure. It may also be the case that task structure is an independent cause of job satisfaction and police attitudes toward citizens. Support for this perspective on task structure is derived from three sources. First, while they did not discuss the point in detail, Jermier and Berkes (1979) found task variability to be significantly positively related to job satisfaction. Second, Katz (1978), in a study of governmental employees including police officers, found "skill variety" to be positively, significantly related to organizational satisfaction. "Skill variety" is defined as the degree to which a job requires the use of different valued skills and abilities (e.g., Aldag & Brief, 1979; Hackman & Lawler, 1971), and skill variety and task variability may be viewed as essentially analogous or overlapping constructs. In fact, versions of the skill variety and task variability indices employed by Katz and by Jermier and Berkes, respectively, have been shown to significantly converge at a level about equal to that evidenced by alternative skill variety indices (Pierce & Dunham, 1978). Third, ample evidence from the more general task design literature indicates that perceived skill variety and employee affective responses are positively, significantly related (e.g., Aldag, Barr, & Brief, in press; Aldag & Brief, 1979; Pierce & Dunham, 1976). Thus, an additional purpose of this study is to investigate the causal relationships between task structure (i.e., skill variety) and (a) job satisfaction, and (b) police attitudes toward citizens.

Additional findings of Katz (1978), however, also are relevant to the purposes of the current study. He found the strength of the relationship between skill variety and job satisfaction to be a curvilinear function of job longevity, with very weak relationships both for new employees and for those with considerable longevity. More generally, other researchers have demonstrated the pervasive impact of job longevity (conceptualized as an index of the socialization process) on a variety of police attitudes and behaviors (e.g., Van Maanen, 1975; Van Maanen & Katz, 1976). Therefore, it is predicted that job longevity will moderate the relationships between skill variety and police responses.

In summary, the purposes of this paper are to report tests of the following hypotheses:

1. For the aggregate sample, role clarification behaviors exhibited by leaders will be positively related to job satisfaction of subordinates and to favorability of their attitudes toward the citizenry.

2. When skill variety is perceived to be relatively high, perceived leader role clarification behaviors will appear to be causally related to job satisfaction and police attitudes towards citizens. When skill variety is perceived to be relatively low, no such relationships will be evident.

3. For the aggregate sample, perceived skill variety will be positively related to job satisfaction and to favorability of attitudes toward the citizenry.

4. The strength of the relationships of perceived skill variety to job satisfaction and attitudes toward citizenry will be a curvilinear function of job longevity. New employees and those with considerable job experience will exhibit weaker relationships than will those employees with intermediate degrees of job longevity.

As previously indicated, the results to be presented have implications for the structuring of police organizations and may serve as the basis for the development of a model which goes beyond those presented by Jermier and Berkes (1979), Katz (1978), and others. In addition, the results are relevant to the more general literatures concerned with leader behavior, task design, and socialization processes.

METHODS

Subjects

Subjects were members of a police force located in a midwestern city with a population of approximately 200,000. A stratified (by rank) random sample of all employees below the rank of inspector who were working on the day of the study was chosen ($n = 75$). Fifteen months later, 70 of these subjects who remained with the department were resurveyed, 68 providing usable data and comprising the present sample. Subjects were brought in off the job individually or in small groups to complete the surveys. Questionnaires were signed and anonymity was guaranteed.

Measures

The Leader Role Clarification Behavior scale (LRCB) was devised after Schriesheim (1978) using six relevant items drawn from the Leader Behavior Description Questionnaire (Stogdill, 1963). A sample item is, "He

lets group members know what is expected of them." The orientation of this scale differs from that used by Jermier and Berkes (1979) in that the items refer to the leader's behavior toward the respondent's work group rather than toward the respondent. Schriesheim (1979) reports finding essentially identical results when comparing a work-group oriented with a modified individually oriented Leader Behavior Description Questionnaire.

Perceived skill variety was measured using a subscale of an early version of the Job Diagnostic Survey, the Yale Job Inventory (Hackman & Lawler, 1971). For relevant psychometric data on the subscale, see Brief and Aldag (1978), Dunham, Aldag, and Brief (1977), and Sims, Szilagyi, and Keller (1976).

General job satisfaction was measured using a 5-item scale from the Yale Job Inventory (Hackman & Lawler, 1971).

Attitudes toward citizenry were gauged using a random ordering of the items from Kelly and Farber's (1974) scale. The scale is composed of four subscales labeled Policeman's View of Citizen Support, General Faith in People, Police Defensive Posture, and Police Stereotyping of Poor People. Each subscale was scored such that a high score was indicative of a positive attitude toward citizenry. For example, a high score on the defensive posture subscale would indicate a positive attitude on the part of the subject toward citizens which would be behaviorally manifested as a relatively low number of defensive actions. Brief, Aldag and Wallden (1976) have favorably evaluated certain psychometric properties of the Kelly and Farber scale.

Means, variances, medians, and coefficient alphas for all scales are presented in Table I.

Analyses

Heise's (1970, 1975) path analytic technique prescribed for dynamic data was applied to the panel data. The technique involves deriving path coefficients between the independent variables at time one and the dependent variables at time two controlling for the respective values of the dependent variables at time one. Path analysis was chosen over cross-lagged correlation analysis because of the known robustness of the former technique to violations of a variety of assumptions (Heise, 1970) and because the current data clearly do not conform to the conditions necessary to perform the latter technique which were recently specified by Kenny and Harackiewicz (1979).²

²For example, Kenny and Harackiewicz argue that if cross-lag analysis is to yield meaningful results, the assumption of stationarity must be met, synchronous correlations should be at least .3, and a very large sample size is required (a sample size of 100 is termed "small for cross-lag analysis" (1979, p. 374)). Also, the measured lag should correspond closely to the causal lag. For a further discussion of the problems inherent in applying cross-lag analysis to panel data, see Toffler (1979).

Table I. Means, Variances, Medians, and Coefficient α 's by Time of Sampling for the Aggregate Scale Data and Job Longevity ($N = 68$)

Variables	Time 1				Time 2			
	Mean	Variance	Median	α^a	Mean	Variance	Median	α
Leader role clarification behavior scale	13.57	23.90	13	.91	13.39	21.61	13	.91
Job satisfaction	27.70	22.92	28	.76	26.83	19.32	27	.67
Attitudes toward citizenry								
Perceived citizen support	13.80	9.05	14	.73	13.36	8.84	13	.71
Faith in people	13.96	9.92	14	.62	13.59	10.02	13	.73
Defensive posture	11.52	16.64	11	.76	11.31	13.17	11	.70
Stereotype of poor people	8.97	14.62	8	.85	9.25	13.05	8	.83
Perceived skill variety	29.97	13.56	30	.49	29.03	18.85	29	.63
Job longevity	4.91	4.69	3		5.78	4.85	4	-

^aCronbach coefficient alpha (Cronbach, 1951).

In order to assess the hypothesized moderating effects of skill variety, the sample was split at the time one skill variety median and separate analyses were performed for each subgroup and for the aggregate sample. To examine the moderating role of job longevity, subgroups were formed on the basis of extremity of job longevity scores. The extreme subgroup consisted of those individuals with two or fewer years on the job and those with seven or more years on the job. All other subjects comprised the moderate subgroup. A Fisher Z transformation was performed on static correlations and a t test was used to assess differences between them. A t test using a pooled estimate of the standard deviation was employed to assess the significance of differences between path coefficients.

RESULTS

As the hypotheses specify the direction in which respective relationships should be found, one-tailed tests of significance were performed. Large differences, however, were found in directions opposite those which were predicted. Consequently, two-tailed tests were also performed. Two-tailed tests alone are reported in Tables II and III.

Hypothesis 1: The results relevant to the first hypothesis are presented in Table II. For the aggregate sample, only three static correlations are

Table II. Aggregate and Subsample Static Correlations and Path Coefficients Relating Leader Role Clarification Behaviors to Dependent Variables

Dependent variable	Aggregate			Perceived skill variety subgroup					
	(N = 68)			High (N = 35)			Low (N = 33)		
	$r_{t_1}^a$	$r_{t_2}^b$	p^c	r_{t_1}	r_{t_2}	p	r_{t_1}	r_{t_2}	p
Job satisfaction	.278 ^d	.355 ^e	.095	.183	.279	.067	.350 ^d	.411 ^d	.128
Attitudes toward citizenry ^h									
Perceived citizen support	.049	.138	.031	-.110	.001	.046	.211	.275	-.018
Faith in people	.303 ^e	.202	.082	.064 ^g	-.110 ^g	.043	.524 ^e	.420 ^e	.089
Defensive posture	.222	.079	.206 ^d	.195	-.237 ^e	.013 ^g	.258	.352 ^d	.367 ^e
Stereotype of poor People	.000	.089	.009	.122	.103	.094	.129	.078	-.057

^aCorrelation at time one between dependent variable and Leader Role Clarification Behavior Scale.

^bCorrelation at time two between dependent variable and Leader Role Clarification Behavior Scale.

^cPath coefficient between Leader Role Clarification Behavior scale at time one and dependent variable at time two.

^d $p \leq .05$ (two-tailed).

^e $p \leq .01$ (two-tailed).

^f $p \leq .001$ (two-tailed).

^gCorrelation/Path coefficient for high perceived skill variety subgroup is significantly different from corresponding coefficient for low perceived skill variety subgroup at $p \leq .05$ (two-tailed).

^hFor each subscale, higher scores indicate more favorable attitudes toward citizenry.

significant. At time one, LRCB is positively correlated with general job satisfaction ($r = .278$, $p < .05$) and with faith in people ($r = .303$, $p < .01$). At time two, LRCB and general job satisfaction are positively correlated ($r = .355$, $p < .01$). The only significant path coefficient ($p = .206$, $p < .05$) in the aggregate sample implies a causal influence of leader role clarification behavior on defensive posture.

Hypothesis 2: Findings relevant to the second hypothesis are also shown in Table II. For the high perceived skill variety subgroup no static correlations or path coefficients are significant.

For the low perceived skill variety group, five static correlations and one path coefficient are significant. LRCB is positively correlated with general job satisfaction ($r = .350$, $p < .05$) and faith in people ($r = .524$, $p < .01$) at time one. At time two, it is positively correlated with general job satisfaction ($r = .411$, $p < .05$), faith in people ($r = .420$, $p < .01$), and defensive posture ($r = .352$, $p < .05$). The only significant path coefficient ($p = .367$, $p < .001$) supports a causal effect of leader role clarification behavior on defensive posture.

Table III. Aggregate and Subsample Static Correlations and Path Coefficients Relating Perceived Skill Variety to Dependent Variables

Dependent Variable	Job longevity subgroup														
	Aggregate (N = 68)					Extreme (0-2 yr & 7 or more yr) (N = 34)					Moderate (3-6 yr) (N = 34)				
	r_1^a	r_2^b	p^c	r_1	r_2	p	r_1	r_2	p	r_1	r_2	p	r_1	r_2	p
Job satisfaction	.235 ^d	.433 ^e	-.003	.252	.430 ^e	.196 ^e	.238	.429 ^e	-.261						
Attitudes toward citizenry ^h															
Perceived citizen support	.118	.081	-.080	.137	.106	-.011	.127	.025	-.124						
Faith in people	.160	.074	-.111	.112	-.070	-.059	.256	.191	-.179						
Defensive posture	-.084	-.101	.129	.028	-.042	-.065	.108	.067	-.205						
Stereotype of poor people	.078	-.066	-.036	-.054	.096	.021	.250	-.217	-.163						

^aCorrelation at time one between dependent variable and Skill Variety scale.

^bCorrelation at time two between dependent variable and Skill Variety scale.

^cPath coefficient between Skill Variety at time one and dependent variable at time two.

^d $p \leq .05$ (two-tailed).

^e $p \leq .01$ (two-tailed).

^f $p \leq .001$ (two-tailed).

^gCorrelation/Path coefficient for extreme job longevity subgroup is significantly different from corresponding coefficient for moderate job longevity subgroup at $p \leq .05$ (two-tailed).

^hFor each subscale, higher scores indicate more favorable attitudes toward citizenry.

Three correlation pairs and one path coefficient pair are significantly different. The correlations of LRCB with faith in people at time one and time two and with defensive posture at time two are significantly larger ($t = 2.02, p < .05$; $t = 2.20, p < .05$; and $t = -2.40, p < .05$, respectively) for the low skill variety subgroup than for the high skill variety subgroup. The path coefficient linking LRCB and defensive posture is significantly greater for the low skill variety group ($t = 2.27, p < .05$).

In summary of the findings relating to leader role clarification behaviors, only moderate support was provided for Hypothesis 1 and none for Hypothesis 2. Relating to hypothesis one, while correlations of LRCB to job satisfaction at both times one and two and to faith in people at time one are significant, the only significant path coefficient is that between LRCB and (low) defensive posture. However, all relationships are in the hypothesized direction. Contrary to Hypothesis 2, the relationships of LRCB to dependent variables are generally strongest for the low perceived skill variety subgroup.

Hypothesis 3: The results relevant to hypothesis three are presented in Table III. For the aggregate sample, only two static correlations and none of the path coefficients differ significantly from zero. At both times one and two, skill variety is significantly related to general job satisfaction ($r = .235, p < .05$ and $r = .433, p < .01$, respectively).

Hypothesis 4: Results relating to Hypothesis 4 are also displayed in Table III. For both the extreme and moderate job longevity subgroups, only the relationship of perceived skill variety to job satisfaction at time 2 is significant. The only significant difference between subgroup path coefficients, that for the relationship between perceived skill variety and job satisfaction, is in the opposite direction from the hypothesized.³

In summary of findings concerning the relationships of perceived skill variety to dependent variables, almost no support is provided for either Hypotheses 3 or 4. Concerning Hypothesis 3, only the static correlations of perceived skill variety to job satisfaction are significant for the entire sample. Contrary to Hypothesis 4, the only significant moderating effect of longevity is opposite that hypothesized.³

³In addition to these analyses in which subgroups were formed on the basis of extremity of longevity scores, exploratory analyses were also performed in which subgroups were formed on the basis of high versus low job longevity. No significant path coefficients were yielded by such analyses, though the path coefficient relating skill variety to job satisfaction was significantly higher ($p < .05$) for the low longevity subgroup than for the high longevity subgroup. These results are available from the first author.

DISCUSSION

The findings of this study provide only limited support for the contention that leader role clarification behaviors may be positively associated with job satisfaction and favorability of attitudes toward citizenry. Further, while static correlations of perceived skill variety to job satisfaction were significantly positive for the aggregate sample, neither the path coefficient relating skill variety to job satisfaction nor any of the relationships of skill variety to attitudes toward citizenry were significant. Also, hypotheses concerning the moderating roles of skill variety and job longevity were uniformly refuted.

In view of the obvious disagreement between results of this study and those of Jermier and Berkes (1979) and of Katz (1978), relevant differences between the studies should be specified. First, as noted earlier, both of the latter studies employed cross-sectional designs while the current study considered both cross-sectional and longitudinal relationships. Comparison of the static correlations in the current study to corresponding path coefficients highlights the point that little can be predicted about the latter on the basis of the former, even when the static correlations were of similar magnitude at both points in time. Such findings clearly suggest the need for additional longitudinal analyses in leadership research. Second, while the current study and that by Katz considered the significance of differences between subgroup correlations in assessing moderating effects, that by Jermier and Berkes did not. That is, they implied that existence of a significant correlation for one subgroup but not the other revealed a moderating effect. Such is not necessarily the case. In fact, our post hoc *t* test, after a Fisher *Z* transformation, shows no significant difference between the correlations reported by Jermier and Berkes ($t = 1.23, p > .20$). Third, differences in the samples employed may have been relevant. Subjects in the Jermier and Berkes study were drawn from a large midwestern police department and those in the Katz study were selected from four governmental organizations. The setting for the current study was a middle-sized midwestern police department which would be considered by most to be very liberal and well educated. Further, the department enjoys a very high selection ratio (for example, over 200 individuals recently applied to fill 20 vacant positions). Efforts have successfully been made to increase female and minority hiring and to avoid the use of authority trappings. New recruits are older than is common in police departments, with a median age of approximately 30 years. In view of such characteristics, the sample may be considered somewhat atypical. It should be noted, however, that such sample characteristics should provide an ideal setting for the testing of Jermier and Berkes' contentions. A fourth difference between this study and those of Katz and of Jermier and Berkes is that average perceived skill variety scores in the current study were quite high (29.97 and 29.03 out of a

possible 35 at time 1 and 2, respectively). In contrast, the mean score reported by Jermier and Berkes was substantially closer to the center of the feasible range, as was that reported by Katz (5.28 on a 7-point scale). Such high means, and correspondingly high medians, could be advanced as an explanation for the failure in the current study to isolate differences in relationships for subgroups dichotomized on the basis of perceived skill variety. On the other hand, the very high perceived skill variety scores for the high subgroup would lead to an expectation of correspondingly strong relationships of LRCB to dependent variables for that subgroup if Jermier and Berkes' contentions are correct. Instead, no such relationships were significant. In fact, average correlations and path coefficients for that subgroup were only .025 and .052, respectively. Thus, the skewed distribution of perceived skill variety scores in the current study cannot be seriously advanced as a cause for the generally nonsignificant findings. Finally, the sample size of the current study was relatively small in comparison with those of Jermier and Berkes and of Katz. However, the failure of this study to replicate the findings of these researchers, if due to a lack of statistical power, would suggest that the magnitude of effects is small.

It should be noted that one other apparent difference between the Jermier and Berkes (1979) study and both the current study and that by Katz (1978)—the specific variety scales utilized—is largely illusory. While the index of task variability used by Jermier and Berkes is supposedly a “macro” measure and the skill variety index employed in this study and by Katz is supposedly a “micro” measure, items comprising the scales are in fact very similar. Further, as noted previously, Pierce and Dunham (1978) have shown the degree of convergence between measures of skill variety and of task variability ($r = .70, p < .001$) to be almost identical to that evidenced between alternative indices of skill variety ($r = .72, p < .001$). As such, findings resulting from use of the task variability and skill variety measures should be readily comparable.

In general, it would appear in considering relevant differences between this study and those by Jermier and Berkes and by Katz that the sample and measures employed in the current study should have provided an appropriate basis for testing of the focal hypotheses.

One lesson that emerges from an attempt to reconcile the current findings with those previously reported is the importance of a direct focus on variables hypothesized to be relevant. For example, while the task variability scale used by Jermier and Berkes focused directly on the degree to which jobs were seen as changeable in general and over time, those authors discussed their findings in terms of task predictability. However, variability does not necessarily translate into lack of predictability. Similarly, Katz explained his findings concerning longevity in terms of changing locus of control and expectations, and other variables. In view of such arguments, the need to directly assess variables of interest seems obvious.

If it is in fact felt that predictability (or, by implication, clarity) of job demands is relevant, that specific variable should be gauged. Similarly, if locus of control, nature of expectations, or related variables are of interest, they should be assessed. Reliance on crude proxies for supposedly relevant constructs results in a situation in which the roles of a number of alternative causal mechanisms cannot be discounted.

A closely related lesson is the need explicitly to specify hypothesized causal mechanisms. For example, Katz in formulating his hypotheses stated that there is "little reason to believe that even the most challenging jobs will not eventually become routinized and habitual as employees become increasingly proficient at their everyday assignments" (1978, p. 207). He further argued that individuals with considerable longevity may employ various psychological defenses to adapt to their environments by becoming nonresponsive to characteristics of their jobs. It seems clear that the mechanisms suggested by these two arguments are distinct. The first explanation presented by Katz views longevity as directly impacting on perceptions of skill variety and other task characteristics. The second considers longevity to moderate the impact of perceived task characteristics on outcomes. While there is some previous support for the former mechanism (e.g., Aldag & Brief, 1977) the latter mechanism—that which Katz actually tests—is more speculative. Future research should clearly distinguish between these alternative mechanisms and directly assess their roles.

A third point, and one which perhaps should not require statement, is that extrapolation of findings from one dependent variable to another may be unwarranted. In particular, affective responses toward the job need bear no necessary relationships to behaviors, behavioral intentions, or attitudes toward other focal objects, such as the citizenry. Thus, while Jermier and Berkes discussed the relevance of their findings for such issues as police authoritarianism and police brutality, neither their results nor those of the current study justify such speculation. For example, Jermier and Berkes' findings concerning the moderating role of skill variety on the relationship between leader role clarification behaviors and job satisfaction were not replicated for that between LRCB and organizational commitment. Similarly, findings concerning job satisfaction as a dependent variable in the current study, while not entirely consistent with those hypothesized, were generally stronger than those relating to attitudes toward citizenry. As such, the tempting leap from satisfaction to other outcomes should at this point be resisted.

In general, findings of the current study suggest the need to exercise caution in generalizing leadership findings from cross-sectional studies or unique situations. In particular, it seems premature to conclude either that job longevity plays a consistent role in moderating the impact of perceived task characteristics or that the impact of skill variety either as a moderator

or independent variable is consistent across situations or dependent variables. Additional studies, focusing directly on supposedly relevant independent variables and moderators, explicitly specifying hypothesized causal mechanisms, and employing longitudinal designs, are clearly required.

REFERENCES

- ALDAG, R. J., BARR, S. H., & BRIEF, A. P. *Measurement of perceived task characteristics. Psychological Bulletin*, in press.
- ALDAG, R. J., & BRIEF, A. P. Moderators of relationships of job behaviors to perceptions of core task dimensions. *Proceedings of the 8th Annual Conference of the American Institute for Decision Sciences*, 1977, 8, 327-329.
- ALDAG, R. J., & BRIEF, A. P. Supervisory style and police role stress. *Journal of Police Science and Administration*, 1978, 6, 362-367.
- ALDAG, R. J., & BRIEF, A. P. *Task design and employee motivation*. Glenview, Ill.: Scott, Foresman & Co., 1979.
- BITTNER, E. The police on skid-row: A study of peace keeping. *American Sociological Review*, 1967, 32, 699-715.
- BRIEF, A. P., ALDAG, R. J., & WALLDEN, R. A. Correlates of supervisory style among policemen. *Criminal Justice and Behavior*, 1976, 3, 263-271.
- BRIEF, A. P., & ALDAG, R. J. The Job Characteristic Inventory: An examination. *Academy of Management Journal*, 1978, 21, 659-671.
- BROWN, M. K. *The impact of alternative forms of citizen control on police organization and police discretion*. Paper presented at the annual meeting of the Association of Voluntary Action Scholars, San Diego, 1977.
- CICOUREL, A. V. *The social organization of juvenile justice*. New York: Wiley, 1967.
- CORDNER, G. W. Open and closed models of police organizations: Traditions, dilemmas, and practical considerations. *Journal of Police Science and Administration*, 1978, 6, 22-34.
- CRONBACH, L. J. Coefficient alpha and the internal structure of tests. *Psychometrika*, 1951, 16, 297-334.
- DUNHAM, R. B., ALDAG, R. J., & BRIEF, A. P. Dimensionality of task design as measured by the Job Diagnostic Survey. *Academy of Management Journal*, 1977, 20, 209-223.
- HACKMAN, J. R., & LAWLER, E. E. Employee reactions to job characteristics. *Journal of Applied Psychology Monograph*, 1971, 55, 259-286.
- HEISE, D. R. Causal inference from panel data. In E. F. Borgatta & G. W. Bohrnstedt (Eds.), *Sociological methodology: 1970*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1970.
- HEISE, D. R. *Causal Analysis*. New York: John Wiley & Sons, 1975.
- HOUSE, R. J. A path goal theory of leader effectiveness. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 1971, 16, 321-328.
- HOUSE, R. J., & DESSLER, G. The path-goal theory of leadership: Some post hoc and a priori tests. In James G. Hunt and Lars L. Larson (Eds.), *Contingency approaches to leadership*, Carbondale, Ill.: Southern Illinois University Press, 1974.
- JERMIER, J. M., & BERKES, L. J. Leader behavior in a police command bureaucracy: A closer look at the quasi-military model. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 1979, 24, 1-23.
- JOHNSON, T. A. The application of organization theory to the problem of police resistance to police community relations. *Journal of Police Science and Administration*, 1975, 3, 85-94.
- KATZ, R. Job longevity as a situational factor in job satisfaction. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 1978, 23, 204-223.

- KELLY, R. M., & FARBER, M. G. Identifying responsive inner-city policemen. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 1974, 59, 259-263.
- KENNY, D. A. Cross-lagged panel correlation: A test for spuriousness. *Psychological Bulletin*, 1975, 82, 887-903.
- KENNY, D. A., & HARACKIEWICZ, J. M. Cross-lagged panel correlation: Practice and promise. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 1979, 64, 372-379.
- KERR, S. Substitutes for leadership: Some implications for organizational design. *Organization and Administrative Sciences*, 1977, 8, 135-146.
- MARCH, J. G., & SIMON, H. A. *Organizations*. New York: Wiley, 1958.
- MOORE, M. D. A normative model for law enforcement in the criminal justice system. *Journal of Police Science and Administration*, 1976, 4, 71-81.
- PERROW, C. A framework for the comparative analysis of organizations. *American Sociological Review*, 1967, 32, 194-208.
- PIERCE, J. L., & DUNHAM, R. B. Task design: A literature review. *Academy of Management Review*, 1976, 1, 83-97.
- PIERCE, J. L., & DUNHAM, R. M. An empirical demonstration of the convergence of common macro- and micro-organization measures. *Academy of Management Journal*, 1978, 21, 410-418.
- REAMS, R., KUYKENDALL, J., & BURNS, D. Police management systems: What is an appropriate model. *Journal of Police Science and Administration*, 1975, 3, 475-481.
- SANDLER, G., & MINTZ, Z. Police organizations: Their changing internal and external relationships. *Journal of Police Science and Administration*, 1974, 2, 458-463.
- SCHRIESHEIM, C. A. *Development, validation, and application of new leadership behavior and expectancy research instruments*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Ohio State University, 1978.
- SCHRIESHEIM, C. A. The similarity of individually directed and group directed leader behavior descriptions. *Academy of Management Journal*, 1979, 22, 345-355.
- SCHRIESHEIM, C., & VON GLINOW, M. A. The path goal theory of leadership: A theoretical and empirical analysis. *Academy of Management Journal*, 1977, 20, 398-406.
- SIMS, H. P., SZILAGYI, A. D., & KELLER, R. T. The measurement of job characteristics. *Academy of Management Journal*, 1976, 19, 195-212.
- SKOLNICK, J. H. *Justice without trial*. New York: Wiley, 1966.
- STOGDILL, R. M. *Manual for the Leader Behavior Description Questionnaire—Form XII*. Columbus: Ohio State University Bureau of Business Research, 1963.
- SWANK, C. V. The police in 1980: Hypothesis for the future. *Journal of Police Science and Administration*, 1975, 3, 294-300.
- TOFFLER, B. L. *Creating an occupational role: A longitudinal study of the role development process*. Unpublished manuscript, Boston University, 1979.
- VAN DE VEN, A., DELBECQ, A. L., & KOENIG, R. Determinants of coordination modes within organizations. *American Sociological Review*, 1976, 41, 322-338.
- VAN MAANEN, J. Police socialization: A longitudinal examination of job attitudes in an urban police department. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 1975, 20, 207-228.
- VAN MAANEN, J., & KATZ, R. Individuals and their careers: Some temporal considerations for work satisfaction. *Personnel Psychology*, 1976, 29, 601-616.

BIOGRAPHICAL NOTES

ARTHUR P. BRIEF is an Associate Professor of Organizational Behavior at New York University. He received his PhD in management and organization from the University of Wisconsin-Madison. His research interests include organization theory, organizational behavior, and public management. He has published approximately 40 articles on these and other topics in the *Academy of Management Journal*, *Journal of Applied Psychology*, *Decision Sciences*, *Organizational Behavior and Human Performance*, *Human Relations*, and else-

where. With Professor Aldag, he is co-author of *Task Design and Employee Motivation* and of *Managing Organizational Behavior*.

RAMON J. ALDAG is an Associate Professor of Organizational Behavior in the Graduate School of Business Administration and Associate Director of the Industrial Relations Research Institute at the University of Wisconsin-Madison. He holds a PhD in management from Michigan State University. His research interests include task design, decision making, and organizational behavior. He has served as chairperson and program chairperson of the Public/Sector Division of the Academy of Management and as chairperson of the Public/Nonprofit Administration track of the American Institute for Decision Sciences. He has published approximately 40 articles in the *Academy of Management Journal*, *Administrative Science Quarterly*, *Organizational Behavior and Human Performance*, *Journal of Applied Psychology*, *Human Relations*, and elsewhere. With Professor Brief, he is co-author of *Task Design and Employee Motivation* and of *Managing Organizational Behavior*.

CRAIG J. RUSSELL is a doctoral student in the Department of Industrial Relations and Human Resources at the University of Iowa.

DALE E. RUDE is a doctoral student in the Department of Management Sciences at the University of Iowa.