The Depot: A Collinsville Market
The Collinsville Depot Market

A PROFESSIONAL PROJECT
SUBMITTED TO THE GRADUATE FACULTY
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the
Degree of
MASTER OF URBAN DESIGN

By
Chris Paulsen
Tulsa, Oklahoma
2020
The Collinsville Depot Market

A PROFESSIONAL PROJECT APPROVED FOR THE
URBAN DESIGN STUDIO
CHRISTOPHER C. GIBBS
COLLEGE OF ARCHITECTURE

BY

Shawn Michael Schaefer, Chair
Dave Boeck AIA
Charlie Warnken, Ph.D.
Table of Contents

Introduction........................................................................................................7
   Introduction........................................................................................................7
   Design Process..................................................................................................9

Methodology.........................................................................................................10
   Empathize..........................................................................................................11
      Stakeholders..................................................................................................11
      Objectives and Goals.....................................................................................11
      Community Engagement..............................................................................13

Define.....................................................................................................................17
   Site Analysis......................................................................................................17
   Parking Study....................................................................................................20
   Potential Parking Needed.................................................................................21

Ideate......................................................................................................................22
   Design Ideas......................................................................................................22

Prototype...............................................................................................................26
   Designs..............................................................................................................28

Test.........................................................................................................................32
   Case Study.........................................................................................................32
   Cost Analysis.....................................................................................................33
   Funding Sources...............................................................................................33
   Potential Partners for Farmers Market.............................................................33

Reference...............................................................................................................35
Introduction

Collinsville is a small but growing community 20 miles north of Tulsa. The city has a thriving downtown population of 7,056 and being only 10 minutes away from its neighbor to the south who is three times their size.

In the summer of 2019 I reached out to Collinsville to see if they had any projects, after speaking with the city manager Pam Polk and other city staff that there was a property that is owned by the city in the downtown core just next the Veteran’s building which is an ideal spot for a placemaking project.

Placemaking is “…a collaborative process by which we can shape out public realm in order to maximize shared value.” (Pps.org, 2019) with that being said this project will rely on the community for ideas and feedback on design proposals. The project followed the IDEO process for design a placemaking project.

This document will show the process of how design came to be from the feedback received by the community and the stakeholders involved. This document will also look at the city of Broken Arrow who has a similar site already developed along with development cost and potential funding sources.
Design Process

The Design process for this project followed the Interaction-Design Foundations Design Thinking Process or IDEO, each stage of this process works together to push the project forward and allows for constant feedback from the community and stakeholders. This can be seen in the image down below. The IDEO contains 5 steps those steps are:

1. Empathize
   The process begins with empathizing. This phase is used to help gain the perspective of the stakeholders and community. This will help gather as much information as possible to achieve the overall objective.

2. Define
   The next phase will define the parameters of the project and what can be done in the project area. This step will also define the goals and objectives of the project.

3. Ideate
   The idea phase is will gather the ideas from the community and stakeholders through meetings and public engagements. This will help to narrow down what the community wants for the vacant space and fair barn.

4. Prototype
   After the ideas have been collected, the project will move into the generating prototypes phase. This will be done through design models and renderings.

5. Test
   The prototype will then be shared with the stakeholders for feedback and go through corrections. This process will be malleable which allows the public and the stakeholders to make changes until they are satisfied.
DESIGN THINKING: A NON-LINEAR PROCESS

1. Empathise
   - Learn about users through testing
   - Empathise to help define the problem

2. Define
   - Tests create new ideas for the project

3. Ideate
   - Learn from prototypes to spark new ideas
   - Tests reveal insights that redefine the problem

4. Prototype

5. Test

INTERACTION-DESIGN.ORG
The people of Collinsville are the driving force behind the project. They know what the city needs most and provides ideas for the project. This is why the Empathising phase is one of most important because it is all about engaging with the community and the stakeholders. This section will cover who are the stakeholders, the goals of the project, and most importantly community engagement findings. The stakeholder group came together after meeting with city staff on who are the key community members. The group is mostly made up of people from various organizations from across the city, such as city commissioners, Main Street Organization, and the Fair Board. The group meet once a month for the length of the project to discuss goals, ideas and designs.

Stakeholders
City Manager - Pam Polk
Assistant City Manager - Craig Stokes
Communications Director - Sherry Campbell
City Planner - Clint Johnson
City Commissioner - Brad Francis

City Commissioner - Melodie Bateman
Planning Commissioner - Tim Desmond
Main Street Director - Keri Fitts
Fair Barn Board Director - Steve Branen

CPS HS Principal - Scott Kiker
Collinsville Chamber - Carri Yount

Project Goals
After meeting with the members on the stakeholder committee, the goals for the project became very clear. The stakeholders worked together to determine what they thought should be key features and outcomes of the project.

A majority of the stakeholders agreed that some of the biggest goals were to relocate the Depot and the Caboose over to the project site and bring new programming to the Fair Barn.

The City of Collinsville’s desired outcome of this project is to generate sales tax revenue, which could be done through with the right programming.
Demographics Comparison

In order to get a better understanding of the characteristics of the population of Collinsville, it is best to look at the Census demographics for the age range within the city limits. This will give a good insight into what activities that site have for all age ranges. A majority of the population consists of middle-aged adults to people who are about to retire.

Collinsville, OK Census Data¹

- Total population in 2018 = 6,720 people
- Median Age = 32.5 years Old
- High School to College Age: 15 years old – 24 years old = 863 ppl out of total or 12.8%
- Post College to Middle Aged Adults: 25 years old – 44 years old = 1,970 ppl our of total or 29.3%
- Post Middle Aged Adults to Retirement Aged Adults: 45 years old – 65 and older = 2,236 ppl out of total or 33.3%

Owasso, OK Census Data¹

- Total population in 2018 = 35,646 people
- Median Age = 32.4 years Old
- High School to College Age: 15 years old – 24 years old = 5,006 ppl out of total or 14.0%
- Post College to Middle Aged Adults: 25 years old – 44 years old = 10,782 ppl our of total or 30.2%
- Post Middle Aged Adults to Retirement Aged Adults: 45 years old – 65 and older = 2,236 ppl out of total or 32.6%

If you compare those numbers to Owasso, you’ll find the two cities are not all that different. Even though Owasso is roughly five times larger than Collinsville their median age is practically the same. The biggest difference is that Owasso has larger group of young people. Statistically Owasso could have a larger group of young people, which could mean more families that could support a local farmers market.

¹American Community Survey, 2018 - 5 year data
Community Engagement

Community engagement is a key step in the design process. These boards were designed to gather information from the community to help drive the design and programing. The boards were used during two different city events between October and November of 2019. The first event was a Just Treats Halloween Event and the second was Cowboy Christmas Tree Lighting.

That key information I hope to collect:

Where Are You From? This question was used to see where in the community were coming from.

Where Do you Shop? This question was used to understand what areas of downtown people were shopping at and what type of retail they were in town for.

What Do You Wish this Space Had? This question was aimed at answering what the community wanted to in the project site.
The stars were used to collect the information of where the people were coming from. The different colors had no value on the data being collected. It just happened to be the largest amount of stickers I could get for the purpose of this research. As mentioned earlier the data collected came for two different events. The difference is mostly seen from this board. The first event a was much larger event brought people from other cities such as Owasso, Skiatook, and even as far as Claremore.

This was good in terms of how well an event can attract people from the surrounding communities. Then second event brought more people from Collinsville which helped contribute to more ideas for the site. The event also took place at the Veterans building and on the project site itself, which also shows that the site has the ability to attract people to this location.
The map shows where people said they shopped. There is a nice balance of shoppers on both ends of downtown, but the store with the most attractions was Scoop & Grind Coffee shop. This even distribution across the downtown is a good sign. It shows the important role for increasing the foot traffic in the downtown core.

There are also plenty of restaurants surrounding the project site and as you can see plenty of people go to them. This could create a symbiotic relationship with the Depot Market and help with generating foot traffic and sales tax.
This board focused on generating ideas from the community on what they would like to see on the design site. The number one idea was a Market. Other ideas that came up was green space /outdoor community space and event space with a stage or gazebo.

These ideas were taken into consideration for the design layout and activities that could be done on the site. It lead the idea of designing a farmers market that in someway incorporated the original depot.
Every project requires a set of boundaries that tells you what the area of focus is, for this project that is called the Define phase. This phase includes an analysis that will break down the site. This will show what can be utilized for future development, such as various utilities, who owns the property on and around the site. There can also be challenges that could be problematic and would need to be evaluated such as the impact the project will have on the surrounding area.

As mentioned above, some times there are challenges that the project might pose to the surrounding area, such as an increase in volume that could put a strain on parking. This phase will look at a study of all the parking in the downtown area and compare the current number of parking spots to the potential impact for project.

These two areas will help set the boundaries and define the project.

Site Analysis

The site terrain has very little elevation change within the property lines, however there is a low spot near the southeast corner, which bleeds into the property to the south. If the city ever wanted to expand the project site into that property, the low spot could effect the layout of the expansion. The reason this being mentioned is because idea to expand came quite a few times in stakeholders meetings.

The site currently has two chain link fences that run east to west, one roughly at the half way point and another around the south property line. These could simple be torn down or re-purposed somehow depending on their condition.

The utilities consist of two 14-foot concrete storm water boxes that run down the middle of the site, along with a water and sewer line running down W Center St. There are electric lines running on the south side of the fair barn. There are a few poles on the site, but according to the city are no longer in use and can be taken down for new development.
Main street and sidewalk with business downtown on either side (Looking West).

Main Street with the design site and railroad and (Looking East).

Main street and with Casey's General Store and Cheri's Donuts (Looking North).

Landscaping next to the Veterans Building and Fair Bran in the back (Looking South).
Parking Study

During the course of several stakeholders meetings, it became clear that there is a perceived parking issue. This parking study is an attempt to if the perception matches the real parking situation, by using objective measures. Currently, the project site is being used for over flow during various city in Downtown. This creates a perception that is there is not enough current parking to support those events, if site is redeveloped. Another issue to consider is how to handle the parking for trucks and trailers for the Collinsville Tri-County Fair that occurs every August.

The Parking Study is broken into four phases.

1. The totaling up the number of parking spots in the study area. This comes to 889 spaces.

2. Number spaces that are public, private, or a combination of the two. The red spaces are the private spaces while the green are public spaces. There are no lots with the combination of the two. The public parking equals to 281 and private parking equals 608. You can see that the amount of private parking out weighs the number of public spaces approximately 2 to 1.

3. The third phase will examine how often the parking is being utilized. This is done by counting the number of cars at various times over a period of time. There was a partial count conducted, but due to COVID-19 it could not be completed. There were a few observations made over a couple of Sundays. It was determined that the first two blocks of public parking was most filled.

4. The fourth phase determines potential demand. This is done by looking it zoning ordinance to determine the parking minimum based on the property use type. The total square footage for the project site is 40,572Sqft and the zoning is Central Business District, which has no parking minimum. The closet use for a farmers market could be Community Center under the Community services use unit, which requires 1 200 sq. ft of floor area. This could be about 202 parkings spaces, but being that the zoning is CBD there is no need to have that much parking.
Potential Parking Locations

Even though the site does not require a large amount of parking there is the potential that this site could large crowds to Collinsville. In the testing phase there are case studies that mention the amount of foot traffic framers market can attract to communities. Some of these cities saw up to 2000 visitors to their communities. That being said it would be a good idea to show a few potential parking options.

You can see on the map potential lot locations. All of the lots would be on any vacant lots behind the main corridor of Downtown. These are only needed if parking reaches peak utilization.

The two closest to the project site are with in reasonable walking distance. Plus they alleviate some of the stress on the street parking. Restaurants near this end of downtown would benefit from the extra parking.

Each lot could hold roughly 25-57 spaces this of course depends on how the are designed. You will see on the Prototyping phase that a parking was added to provide additional parking to the project site. It has a total of 57 parking spots. That includes 3 handicap spaces one being van accessible and 9 spaces for RVs. Leaving only 45 standard parking spaces, which almost equivalent to one whole block of parking on Main Street.

Legend
- Possible Parking Lots
- Parking Type
- Private Parking
- Public Parking
After producing over a dozen different design layouts, it was time to move to something concrete and use the property boundaries along with the surrounding structures to better visualize the site. As you can see on the next page in the image on the right, this is the base plan I used. It contains boundaries, building outlines, sidewalks, and small circles that represent power poles. This plan is used to nail down the final designs.

These ideas early in the process help set the stage for future designs. It helps set the stage for the placement of key elements like the Depot. Next, we will look at how this new base map is used for final designs.

The Ideate Phase is all about taking the ideas from the community engagement events and the stakeholders and create a design that reflects their ideas. These ideas are not just what features the site should have, but also how the site should be laid out. This process started with stakeholder committee meetings. They had ideas about moving the Depot and the Caboose over from existing locations and having a stage for events or weddings. Other ideas for the project came from the public engagement events, including a green space with trees, seating, and a farmers market.

**Design Ideas**

The site was shaped in stakeholder meetings and at public events, but the process had to move forward. I started making hand sketches on simple tracing paper (See Pg 23. Image on the left). There were many different designs during this stage, it was all about trying to find a layout that best fits the project site.

These early designs used various shapes to represent key elements like depot or market stalls. Other key elements include a gazebo, water tower, a water fountain, and the cargo containers. During this early stage, cargo containers were an option. After a few discussions with the stakeholders, they were rejected in favor for a design based on the original Depot. These containers would have been used as little pop-up shops that could operate during the farmers market or everyday of the week based on need.

Many of the drawings in the first design phase had a common theme of aligning the Depot parallel to the rail road tracks. It is fitting that the Depot is placed next to the tracks. The Depot is alongside with market stalls for the farmers market that could set up to allow for the maximum use on the site.

Two of the other elements that were used heavily in the first few drawings are the water fountain, and the gazebo. Most of the drawings placed the fountain at the south end of the project site. This is a terminal point for the site as a whole. Other schemes placed it near the middle as a break between the market stalls. The gazebo was usually up near the front of the site to create a good connection to the Veterans Building if an event like a wedding took place in it.
Image of early designs on onion paper

Design Site Layout

Chris Paulsen
Masters Candidate

Design Site Layout
As you can see the new base map provide a better detail layout not just for the site but for how the site interacts with the surrounding properties and help narrow down the design to two potentially strong ideas A and B. C is a similar design concept to B, except it shows how the depot could fit on the property currently owned by city. This is an easier idea since the city wouldn’t have to expand property to the south.

Ideas A and B are fully laid out and have all the key elements with changes on where they placed and except for the water fountain, are designed somewhat similarly except for how the depot is laid out.

Looking at the changes that made f the gazebo down to the end of the site to create a terminal point, which creates a nice location for events by being not to close to the street and but not far enough away that it couldn’t be used in tandem with the Veterans building for events like weddings or concerts.

Another similarity between the schemes is the placement of the depot running parallel to the train tracks on the east side of the property. This becomes a key element when thinking about where the Caboose should go. Design A put it in the middle of the board-walk with the Depot and pavilion north of it and another pavilion to the south. This allows for more interactive use for the Caboose, allowing people to walk around it. It also gives the look of it being on the tracks. Design B places it in front of the Depot to show a direct connection with depot, as if one could step on it from the depot itself. Both show a unique way of tying the Depot and Caboose together.

There are also new elements that have been added to the design which come from comments by the public. These include the lawn and seating with shade.
In order to keep the process moving forward, these two designs with the most potential were shown to the stakeholders and the public for feedback to nail down the final design. Most of the preferred design looks the same as the previous versions. It has a central green space with a dance floor and stage, and a gazebo at the end. Planters with trees to help provide shade during the hottest part of the day, a water fountain over by the fair barn and a water tower on the north side of the Depot. The design has much in common with option C. The stakeholders along with the public loved how the Depot matched the original location of the Depot back in its prime.

In this version the Caboose is located in front of the Depot, later on there was ideas about leaving it in its current location next to the fair barn at the corner of S 10th St and Center St, this would ultimately create a gateway entrance for visitors who were coming into the plaza from the southwest corner. Though not shown here it was a well received idea. As you will see in the next section, the Caboose is moved to the ideal spot.

With the design site fully laid out, I needed to integrate the Veterans Building and Fair Barn. A popular idea was the use of food trucks with seating, which is the perfect component to connect the two sides together. The Veterans Building parking lot is mostly used for parking and the occasional car trying to take a short cut. A simple idea for the parking would be to place tables and chairs for the food truck park. The tables and chairs are not permanent fixture to the site. The organization who sets up for events can place the chairs and tables however they want to for event like the farmers market or a food truck night.

Now that the stakeholder committee have approved the design layout the next step in the process was to create a 3D model prototypes to better explore the design development.
The stakeholders recommended changes to the layout from the previous section. One suggestion is to move the caboose behind the gazebo. This helps sell the idea that this site was actually a depot at one point. It also creates an illusion that the gazebo is boarding area for the train. Another change is to connect the roof-line of the gazebo to the depot, which reinforces the overall experience of the site being a depot.

The site also has a food truck park, which could be set up for events like the farmers market. There are also string lights over it which is one option for lighting the park in the evening. String lights also reinforce the feeling that the Veterans building and the depot are both visually and physically connected. During the last meeting of the project the stakeholders thought that another lighting option could be tree lights. The reason for this was so that it would blend in more with the site and not take away from the historical feeling the depot created.

The Fair Barn as a whole did not change very much. There was one recommendation for the Fair Barn which was to convert the concession stand with bathroom into public restrooms. Another added features to the Fair Barn was to add a service drop off for events and additional parking. The parking lot to the south of the Fair Barn will help with the overflow generated by the events at the site. The parking lot was designed to hold 45 cars and 10 trailers or RVs. There is also 18 additional parking spots on the street.

Next we have to think about what kind of events will be held at The Depot. Looking back in previous sections, it is clear the community wanted a farmers market. Another type of event could be a movie night, which the site is also well-suited. The renderings you will see on the next few pages illustrate these scenarios.
Final Design Site Plan

- Food Truck Park
- Green Space
- Water Tower
- Dance Floor
- Veterans Building
- Fair Barn
- Caboose
- Gazebo
- Public Restrooms
- Service Drop-off
- Public Parking based on Future Demand

Public Parking based on Future Demand
The testing phase is exactly what it sounds like it you are testing the prototype and scenarios with the community for feedback. It can also be about looking at case studies that are similar in nature to this project. These case studies have been tested on a larger community level, which get can help guide this project to success. This phase also covers a cost analysis and potential funding sources. It also will identify potential partners to help organize the Farmers Market and other events.

Case Studies

**Broken Arrow, OK - Rose District**

Population - 35,646

This city was chosen due to it’s close proximity to Collinsville. Rose Districts farmers market is a good test site for it’s similarity in size to this project.

Rose District is a local example that shows how well this project could work. Their farmers market has over 30 vendors which bring in 200 - 1000 visitors for the whole district. This type of increase in foot traffic for a downtown can help generate more sales tax revenue. At this time Broken Arrow has yet to calculate the impact of potential sale tax revenue. Though a group called the Institute of Place Management conducted a study called Markets Matter (2015). This study shows that “Markets increase foot traffic by 15 to 27 percent compared to cities without markets.”

The funding for the development of the Rose District came from four sources: Community Development Block Grant (CDBG), Tulsa Vision Fund, BA Public Schools and Private Investors.

All of this information tells us that a farmers’ market can attract large crowds of people which could have positive impact on the sales tax revenue. It also identifies potential funding sources.

The last two case studies come from a video by The Citizens’ Institute on Rural Design. The video is called “Local Food: The Secret Ingredient for Vibrant Downtowns”. The video is about “how farmers markets and co-ops are addressing their local community needs while stimulating downtown development.” Which perfectly describes what this project is doing.

**Webb City, Mo - Farmers Market**

Pop. 11,000

The reason this Webb City was selected as test case was because it is a rural community with a similar population size. Webb city also faces similar challenges when it comes to developing a farmers market. Such as funding sources and generating profit.

Webb City is a town that is a bit bigger than Collinsville. They started the farmers market in the year 2000 opening once a week. After three years their annual sales came out to about $200,000. By 2015 they had increased that to $600,000 and became a year round market. They also found that if you “Grow the farmer base = Grow the market” (Anon 2020). The farmers are the backbone of the market and by growing that base you are growing the sales the market can bring in.

Webb also created a program where kids eat free on Tuesday. It offers a free lunch using market foods through a USDA grant. Also initiated a food stamp matching program to provide vegetables to those who can’t afford any. Between the SNAP program and the USDA program the market doubled their sales on these days.

This case shows that with a large farmer support group and with the right programs in place the potential for a successful market is great.

**Marquette, MI - The Commons**

Pop 21,000

Marquette makes another good test case because the placement of their market is very similar to Collinsville. Even though the population is closer to Broken Arrow, it reinforces the connect a market has to a community center.

The Commons was a community center with an empty gathering space in front it. The space originally housed the ice rink in the winter. The city decided to move the farmers market over there to utilize the space more efficiently. The site provided up to 50 which attracted roughly 2,000 per market day. This is very similar to the relationship of the Veterans building to the design site. Again you can see the effect a market can have on foot traffic.
These case studies show how effective farmers markets can be for a city. They generate revenue not only for themselves, but for the city and the surrounding business owners. The town can also forge a strong relationship with the farming community and give farmers more opportunity to sell crops. Utilize programs to help feed kids and low income families. One other point is that you do not need a fully developed site to start a farmers market. The market can start as soon as possible on the site and the fair barn as long as you have the vendors. Next I will look at the cost of developing the site.

Cost Analysis

As you can see the total cost of the project would be around $2.4 million before a 15 percent contingency. Which could increase the price to almost 2.8 million. All the prices are based on the materials listed below. This cost analysis is not a final cost. It is a rough cost estimate based on area and square footage. It does not include labor or landscaping. This analysis was done by L.H. Associates. The prices are set at current cost of material and is just a possible value.

### Structure Type | Cost
--- | ---
Pavilion x2 | $552,000
Gazebo | $115,343
Planters | $50,000
Water Tower | $150,000
Green Space | $227,500
Stage/Green Space | $50,000
Paved surface | $1,014,300
Landscaping | $60,000
Lighting | $100,000
Relocation of Depot | $150,000
Relocation of Caboose | $5,000

Total | $2,474,143.00
Plus 15% contingency Totaling | $2,845,264.45

Funding Sources

There are two different options for funding/promoting the farmers market option 1. USDA Farmers Market Promotion Program³ and option 2. TSET Healthy Incentive Grants for Communities⁴. Since Collinsville is lacking a Farmers market these would be good at getting initial funding for the market. These two grants would mostly be good for the farmers market. It would not help with constructing the Depot or planters.

Option 1. The USDA program would Increase access to fresh local food and create new market opportunities. Funding for this ranges from $50,000 to $250,000. There is one catch though, the applicant would need to match 25% of funding being requested.

Option 2. The TSET program is all about promoting healthy living in communities. One of those areas is access to healthy and nutritious foods which means markets are included. The funding is broken down into population size and the into sub-classes of Bronze, Silver, or Gold. The maximum amount of combined rewards comes out to $50,000. Also it does not require the applicant to match a percentage.

Funding for construction would most likely need to come from a mix of private investors and philanthropic organizations. Grants would work as well, but it can not cover the entire cost. Looking back at Broken Arrow there at least four different investors to develop the entire Rose District. Which reinforces the fact that the funding needs to come from multiple sources.

Potential Partners for Farmers Market

In order for the market to succeed it will require local organizations to help run it. This could be mixture of different entities across the city. Including, could be Collinsville Inc. (Main Street Organization), the City, or a possible a private company or nonprofit. This group could not only help create the farmers market, but also help create programming. Since programming is a key component for success. Main Street might be best suited for this task. They can help create events that could occur each year on the project site. A second key component is funding and the city could help with accessing grants for those programs or event. The last key to success is having someone to oversee the operations of the market. A private company could provide someone to run the market.
This is of course just an option, but having a collaboration to oversee the site would lead to better success.

Since this is the testing phase, I would recommend that a committee be put together to start the process for creating a farmers market. This entire project should be done incrementally. There is no reason that a farmers market could not be up and running by next season in 2021. Starting slowly allows you to build on small successes and show the community that this space can be used for more than an empty lot. After a while the community will have more buy-in. This can lead to interest from private developers who want to invest in the community. Demonstrating viability will ultimately lead to the development of this project. I think the project has the potential not only to be one of the best markets in the area, but a tourist attraction for the community. Making Collinsville a top destination in Northeast Oklahoma.
References

1. American Community Survey, 2018 - 5 year data


